Change at the Top of Air Canada: The Governing Liberal Party

Perspective—An Analysis of Non-Corporeal Actants

Christopher M. Hartt

(Dalhousie University, Halifax, NS B3H 4R2, Canada)

Abstract: This paper relies on Actor-Network and Critical Sensemaking theories as expressed through the concept of non-corporeal actants to explore the multiplicity of recollection. Dealing with the 1968 Air Canada CEO appointment and the manner in which that event was understood by Canadian Liberals and depicted in histories of the party.

Key words: crown corporation management; historical analysis; decision analysis

JEL codes: H830, M150, N420

1. Introduction

"Politics is a strange mistress" (Halbert, 2012). This quote represents the patriarchal nature of the political process in 1968 quite well. Politics is an actor-network that is driven primarily by men and male processes. It could be argued that this has changed in the last forty years but we should be reminded to contextualize our history (White, 1984, 1988). In 1968, the political parties consisted primarily of men and those men reflected the male ego and significant desire for power (McCall-Newman, 1982). For this reason, this paper has been phrased in particularly androcentric terms.

Joining a political party in the 1960s was more a process of family tradition and social groupings than a choice based on ideological principles. Pierre Elliott Trudeau (Prime Minister of Canada in 1968) may have been an exception to this generalization as he appears to have been an independent thinker (Stewart, 1971; Trudeau, 1993). But as a French-Canadian Roman Catholic, Trudeau would have been expected to be a Liberal from birth regardless of the path he chose. Paul Hellyer (Minister of Transport under Trudeau) was from a similarly Liberal background although he was an Anglophone. In the manner of politicians, they both sought power. Trudeau defeated Hellyer for the Party leadership in 1968 and became Prime Minister. Hellyer stayed in the Cabinet for a few years but left over a dispute and joined or formed several national parties over the following decades (Hellyer, 1990, 2003).

In the analysis of an actor-network of political operatives critical sensemaking (CSM) (Helms Mills, Thurlow, & Mills, 2010) is more prominent in the seven moves searching for NCAs than it might be in another study. The rationale behind this is the nature of politicians which tends to focus on the desire to get re-elected or for those in

---

Christopher M. Hartt, Ph.D., Assistant Professor, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Business & Social Sciences, Dalhousie University; research areas/interests: decision analysis, actor-network theory, critical sensemaking, organizational history. E-mail: Chris.Hartt@Dal.Ca.

the backroom, to get their guy or party elected and re-elected so they can wield power. Political persons seem to network because networks are necessary to secure power rather than being motivated by affiliation or achievement (Trudeau, 1993). Affiliation is a means of building alliances for power in the political structure. When the Air Canada management refused to support Hellyer's promise (during the leadership campaign) to keep the Winnipeg Shops open, it seems affiliation with Herb Seagrim, then Executive Vice-President of Air Canada was no longer of value to Hellyer (Pigott, 2001). Yves Pratte who was appointed CEO of Air Canada in the autumn of 1968 had been mentioned by Trudeau as a possible candidate, so it is conceivable that Hellyer thought appointing Pratte would build his influence with Trudeau (Pigott, 2001). In order to surface the NCAs present in this network we have to delve deeply into the sensemaking of the individual actors within the network. Therefore, in this paper as it is processed through the seven moves described in Hartt (2013a), the analysis will focus on the properties of the sensemaking situation (Weick, 1995) in order to surface NCAs.

2. Theoretical Base

The theoretical base for the case study in this paper is the non-corporeal actant (NCA). Specifically, NCAs that describe and provide a plausible role for ideas, concepts, and perspectives in the actor-network. By introducing CSM, this paper attempts to surface how NCAs influence the choices of sensemakers. It seems that NCAs are relational between the fixed nature of inscriptions and the ongoing sensemaking of individual actors. In the case analysis these individuals are the chroniclers of the events in histories and those who inform them (provide the traces). Individuals appear to make meanings via interactions among the ideas, concepts or perspectives which are described as NCAs within those actor-networks. It is this meaning and its influence which cannot be concretized and therefore is non-corporeal. Some meanings are shared; at least partially, but plurality of effect suggests that everyone has their own unique understanding of the world (including those actor-networks) (Reiss, 2009). This meaning is enacted by the individual but, it is contended, cannot be explained and is unique.

The described seven moves are employed as a means of surfacing action in networks. Individuals act but their actions appear to be influenced by the groups to which they belong. The critical sensemaking (CSM) aspects of the decisions made by individuals give clues to their identities. A strong component of identity is the sense of belonging one gets from groups (Dutton, Roberts, & Bednar, 2010; Gioia & Thomas, 1996; Grant, Dutton, & Rosso, 2008; Helms Mills & Mills, 2004; Sveningsson & Alvesson, 2003). Tracing the networks and the effects of individual actions on enrollment provides a means of assessing the importance of the network to the individual. In the description of the non-corporeal actant (NCA), it has been proposed that this agent in the network as an important force in the CSM process as well as enrollment. The moves aid in the teasing of potential NCAs from the black box of the processes within the network and individuals. The moves are:

Move 1: Identify the problematic event.

Move 2: Identify the actors and corporeal actants in the networks.

Move 3: Surface the possible locations of sensemaking activities.

Move 4: Identify sensemaking properties of the events.

Move 5: Identify significant enrollments and de-enrollments of Human Actors (and punctualized networks).

Move 6: Identify the NCAs enrolled and de-enrolled: Describe changes in sensemaking apparent in the network after the enrollments and de-enrollments

Move 7: Identify the persistent NCAs which were linked to de-enrolled human actors: Surface the influence

of previous networks and future networks in the production of identity and therefore sensemaking.

NCAs were originally as a powerful means of linking CSM (Hartt, 2013a, b; Helms Mills & Mills, 2000a). CSM begins with Weick's (1995) work in sensemaking and particularly the properties of sensemaking situations:

(1) Grounded in identity construction

Identity is a key to understanding sensemaking. In CSM this property is quite prominent (Helms Mills, Thurlow, & Mills, 2010). Because individual identity is continuously redefined by experiences and contact with others, this property is prominent in the interrelation of CSM with ANT. Networks are places where contact with other occurs and the development of NCAs appears to occur in these points of friction. Ideas have meanings which are shaped by actors but held separately and uniquely by individuals and subsumed within identity.

(2) Retrospective

Sensemaking is usually described in retrospective perspectives. We predict our future by referring to our past. Earlier in this paper forward looking sensemaking is proposed as an important consideration in understanding the decisions of authors. Extending from this form may demonstrate the importance of CSM. Decisions made on the basis of how they will be viewed by others is both prospective and indicative of the power of the social on our choices. This helps bring ANT into the discussion. The following of actors and actants in the network provides a means of understanding choices made by individuals. Of particular interest are the NCAs and their persistent impact on the sensemaking of individuals. In the prospective sense, we employ the past to propose a future which gives meaning to decisions, choices and actions. When discussing the Winnipeg shops, the dominating Liberal politicians of AC enacted retrospection on previous elections where the loss of AC jobs in that city impacted electoral results.

(3) Focused on and by extracted cues

The moves presented earlier require extensive following of traces and thematic analysis of narratives present in histories as well as in text; text in the expanded sense (Barthes, 2000; Baudrillard, 1983; Preston, Wright, & Young, 1996). For this work cues are extracted from written text, notes, photographs, other images and the relational or hierarchical positioning of text. For example, prior to the announcement of Pratte as CEO, Seagrim's photo was regularly found on the front page of Between Ourselves; after the appointment he was reported in the later pages. In the book *Grits*, the Pratte appointment is noted in a long list of French-Canadians elevated to key roles but not singled out for discussion (McCall-Newman, 1982).

(4) Driven by plausibility rather than accuracy

Sensemaking and CSM are ongoing. We are always assessing and re-assessing the past, the now and possible futures. This process relies on satisfying (achieving an acceptable threshold) rather than exactness or accuracy. Sensemakers are driven by plausible cues and extracted patterns, which they try to compare to experience. It is believed that it seemed plausible to Minister Hellyer that a successful French-Canadian Lawyer (Pratte) would be able to control AC and produce the results (social and political) desired by the Liberal Party and the Government.

(5) Enactive of the environment

Our environment include both physical structures but also the metaphysical reality of organizations, interactions and reflection. Managers at AC could not understand the Government's desire to promote French in the airline because they believed it would be expensive. The Government seems to have felt that redressing the discrimination against French-Canadians was a priority and cost was irrelevant (McCall-Newman, 1982). The environment within the Government network had changed from the C. D. Howe (The Minister who set up TransCanada Airlines in 1937 and played a central role in the Liberal Governments of Prime Minister MacKenzie

King) period but the AC managers had not kept abreast of the changes.

(6) Social

Sensemaking is a social process. Whether physically present or not; relatives, friends, co-workers, superiors and subordinates influence our perception of events. In the formal sense organizational rules, routines, symbols, and language direct an individual's sensemaking activities by providing routines or scripts for appropriate conduct (Mills & Murgatroyd, 1991). When faced with the choice of an AC insider who they did not feel would follow their objectives, the actor-network of the Liberal Party appears to prefer appointing a CEO for AC from their social network. Traces from the Hellyer files appear to indicate that an outsider (from an American airline) was sought but the connections between the AC management and other airline CEOs kept others out of the running, limiting the Government's choices. Two narratives seemed acceptable, the early AC narrative of bringing in an experienced airline executive from the U.S.A. or the social narrative of a partisan Liberal being appointed.

(7) Ongoing

Sensemaking is circular-it has no beginning or end. In part this is because sensemaking and CSM are driven by uncertainty. Enrollments and de-enrollments of human actors, non-human actants and NCAs in the actor-network may be a significant source of uncertainty. The inherent uncertainty of the NCA with its ephemeral meaning is also an ongoing source of uncertainty. By surfacing NCAs the moves hope to describe sources of uncertainty which lead to changing sensemaking and cue us to the power and influence described in CSM. Hellyer and the AC management (Herb Seagrim was Executive VP of Air Canada at the time and effectively in charge) clashed over the Winnipeg shops question but Hellyer seemed willing to accept Seagrim as AC CEO (McGregor, 1967; McGregor, 1967). But, Gordon McGregor, Air Canada President (who was past retirement age) and Seagrim did not take Hellyer's concerns as potentially fatal to the appointment of Seagrim (McGregor, 1980). The actor-network of the Liberal Party seems to have considered the various issues with AC: closing the Winnipeg shops, Francophone rights, advertising contracts, etc. very seriously and doubted the usefulness of AC to the Party's future (Axworthy, 1969a, 1969b; Baxter, 1967, 1968; O'Brien, 1969; Staff, 1968a, 1968b; Stevenson, 1987; Stoner, 1968a, 1968b).

Although some properties are more visible from time to time and appear to dominate; the seven properties of sensemaking situations identified by Helms Mills as central to the development of CSM may influence individual sensemaking simultaneously (Helms Mills & Mills, 2000b; Helms Mills et al., 2010). Central to the CSM explanation is the construction of identity. Identity provides a strong link to ANT as we seem to construct our identity (in part) via the groups (actor-networks) in which we enroll (Latour, 2005a, 2005b).

As Latour (2005a) describes, we find networks by following actors around. In the following of human actors we encounter the non-human but concrete (actants) and the non-corporeal. The development of the non-corporeal actant (NCA) is an attempt to describe the role of ideas in the very local outlining of choice within a network. If we accept the concept of ideology as a collection of ideas rather than one idea (Hinich & Munger, 1996), we can open up this black box as we shine light on the actor-network. Each idea in the collection expresses itself uniquely for each individual actor; it is this difference which produces the non-corporeal aspect, the only body is that of the host. As the ideas interact in the ideology (and the host) each changes in the ongoing sensemaking of the individuals.

Politicians are particularly sensitive to this ongoing process as they interact with many groups and enrol in several actor-networks in the pursuit of political support and power. These new interactions result in a changing self-identity and resulting sensemaking influences. The central political figure of the narrative of the Liberal

network at the time, Paul Hellyer (Minister of Transport), not only changed his political influences within the Party but he also exited the network. First, he started his own political party and later he joined the Progressive Conservatives and even ran for the leadership of that party in the 1970s. These actions may have played a role in his donation of material unflattering toward the Liberal Party to the National Library and Archives.

3. Method

As empirical sources archival traces have been explored and researched. For this paper the materials searched included thousands of pages of the airline records, government records and press reports. Specifically useful were the materials available online: the Cabinet Conclusions and those from the Liberal Party and the Trudeau period. Newly available (previously secret) material in the National Library and Archives (Canada) allowed a fuller interrogation of produced narratives. AC, like most airlines, saved a great deal of its material, the archives available are exhaustive. The research followed this material to surface themes from the traces left by actors (Mills & Helms Mills, 2006). NCAs were proposed as structures of power, archival material may aid in surfacing these (Mills, 1956). ANTi-history has provided ideas and techniques used to find traces and investigate the found themes (Durepos & Mills, 2011).

Because the traces are varied in form and the audience for which they were created, the analysis was primarily thematic (Bowen, 2008; Krippendorf, 2008). This analytical form employs feedback loops not unlike a hermeneutic circle (Prasad, 2002), and is referred to as post-processural. Each potential trace was read by the author and the selected text was clustered by themes. From a practical perspective traces are scanned, converted to searchable PDF and then copied key passages into Microsoft Word files by theme. New traces were read until no new themes appeared (saturation) (Silverman, 2005). The themes are contingent upon the reader's interpretation of the text as influenced by the tens of thousands of pages considered.

4. The Liberal Government Narrative

In the period leading up to the founding of Trans-Canada Airlines (later Air Canada) in 1937, there was a political struggle stemming from the conflicting ideas behind the national railroad project: the railroad had been built by private firms using government money. As the project progressed it was beset by cost overruns and scandals related to the use of the money and political interference. A belief that the private firms had unfairly benefitted and that Government should not directly invest in this way developed. This was deepened by the level of foreign investment in Canadian Pacific Railways (CPR), the builder/owner of the largest portion of the rails. CPR had received significant construction funding from the Government of Sir John A. MacDonald in the late 19th century (Conservative). By 1930, a struggle existed between the two primary railways in Canada, CPR and Canadian National Railways (CN). The latter was a crown corporation, which appears to have been formed by successive Liberal Governments to counter CPR and was described as the chosen instrument of the MacKenzie King Liberal Government (Pigott, 2001; Smith, 1986).

Airlines began to operate in other countries and regionally within Canada. Discussions in both the public and private sectors began about the need for a national airline (Collins, 1978; Smith, 1970). Because Canada is a large and sparsely populated country, the feeling was that competing private airlines would not naturally evolve as they had in the United States. Government involvement would be required as it had in the railroad project. Competing debates of whether the airlines should be private or public challenged the political will. The political discourse of

the problems of the railroad project appears to have performed as a stronger NCA in the network of the Liberal Party. They did not want to repeat the problems of foreign ownership, so chose to form a subsidiary unit of CN as an airline (P. Smith, 1986).

The debates present in that formation (public versus private) persisted and continued through into the period of the events discussed in this analysis. The competition of understandings also spawned a competition between airlines. Small private airlines developed and some merged into a CPR project that eventually became Canadian Airlines, a political-economic foe of Air Canada.

Being sensitive to questions surrounding the subsidies C.D. Howe—the minister responsible for the airline in various Liberal Governments from 1935 to 1957—was careful to minimize the funds provided to the airline. These funds were usually provided in the form of loans via CN. The shared idea (NCA) that evolved in Air Canada was of cost control and profitability. It was politically advantageous to the Liberal Party that Air Canada was cost neutral and in turn, the Liberal Governments permitted the airline to operate somewhat independently.

This understanding within the Party may have changed when the Liberals returned to power in 1963 following the defeat of a Conservative Government. The Conservatives had not dismantled Air Canada or any of the crown corporations. Some in the Liberal Party may have decided that the criticisms of crown corporations as anti-democratic were moot. Protecting the Party from criticism over public funds usage was no longer a strong NCA. However, it appears that the management of Air Canada did not comprehend the change. Air Canada continued to follow the apparent NCA of being businesslike and independent while the Liberals seemed to want their crown corporations to be instruments of Party priorities. The contradictions of NCAs appear to have produced much of the conflict which led to a management change.

Move 1: Identify the problematic event

In the management histories described elsewhere (Hartt, Mills, Helms Mills, & Corrigan, 2013), the apparent passing over of Herb Seagrim is a significant event. But, the story is not told in accounts of the Liberal Party or Federal Government of the late 1960s. The differences in the chronicling of the story position this event as problematic. The Liberal Party story of that period is the ascendancy of Trudeau-mania, the followers of the charismatic Pierre Elliott Trudeau, who became leader of the Liberal Party and Prime Minister in April 1968 (Trudeau, 1993). Central to Trudeau's election as leader and Prime Minister was his concept of a *Just Society*. The *Just Society* was to be bilingual (including French-Canadians), tolerant and participatory; protecting civil rights and promoting social justice. To enact these ideas (NCAs), the Government set about the righting of past wrongs, particularly the perceived poor treatment of French-Canadians (Stevenson, 1987).

Accounts of the Pratte appointment as a political accomplishment within the histories of the Liberal Party, Trudeau and the Government of the time, focus on his French-Canadian lineage (McCall-Newman, 1982). Pratte was French-Canadian; few senior managers in Government, government agencies or crown corporations were French-Canadian before Trudeau became Prime Minister. Pratte is included in the long list of appointments made by the Trudeau Liberals redressing this injustice (McCall-Newman, 1982). In the history of the Liberal Party of the period, the retrospective sense made of the appointment is that it was a positive step, demonstrating the successful balancing of the two "founding cultures".

Traces from the records of the Party provide alternate narratives for the story of the selection and appointment of Pratte (Axworthy, 1969a; Baxter, 1968; Hellyer, 1968b; O'Brien, 1969; Stoner, 1968b). It appears that the bilingualism narrative is a plausible storyline leaving out political intrigue, personal battles and the struggle for power over the direction of the airline (Executive, 1967; Hellyer, 1968a; Staff, 1968b; Stoner, 1968a).

Digging into the archives of the Minister of Transport and Cabinet Conclusions of that time produce competing narratives of a Minister and a Government determined to get rid of McGregor and Seagrim; with Pratte as the benefactor (and perhaps later victim) of this desire (Hellyer, 1968a; McGregor, 1967).

Histories of the Party and leader may omit this anti-narrative necessarily. The books are sold to both advocates and opponents of the Party but in this case; Trudeau was/is a popular man. There are more potential buyers from among his fans than his detractors. The network of publication would not look for negative aspects of the *Just Society* or the use of its slogans for political expediency. It is also possible that the authors did not have full access to the files related to patronage and advertising among Crown agencies; however the conflict surrounding the Winnipeg Maintenance facility was public and available to them.

Move 2: Identify the actors and corporeal actants in the networks

Key political figures of the time in Canada form the basis of this network. Some of these people were in the backrooms or the hierarchy of the Party outside of public life. Their service could be described as public but might be more aligned with the idea of keeping the Liberal Party in government. These persons and their means of interaction are the key actors and actants enrolled in the actor-network surrounding the political party. Much of their interaction was hidden from the chroniclers of the histories who wrote before Paul Hellyer's files and the Cabinet Conclusions became publicly available. Nonetheless, the contents of that information were known to the informants (i.e., the chroniclers interviewed and corresponded with to research their books). In the network of the Liberal Party surrounding the Air Canada succession decision there were strong players with vested interests in the decisions of the organization. Paul Hellyer, Minister of Transport, was a central figure. Ultimately the organization reported to parliament through him. Along the way to that reporting relationship, Hellyer networked with Prime Minister Trudeau; with Minister without Portfolio, James Richardson (an MP from Winnipeg); and with Lloyd Axworthy, his executive assistant (who later represented Winnipeg for the Trudeau Liberals). The actions of this network were contentious among Quebec Liberals (Staff, 1968a). An important issue to these actors was the relocation of the maintenance shops from Winnipeg to Montreal. For Quebec Liberals, this was a plus, but for Richardson and Axworthy it was a problem (Axworthy, 1969b). Loss of jobs in Winnipeg could lead to a loss of votes.

Hellyer wanted to keep the shops in Winnipeg. He had run against Trudeau for the leadership and as part of his campaign had promised to keep the jobs in Winnipeg. At one point he tried to get a commitment from Air Canada CEO McGregor and VP Seagrim so he could announce it, but they refused. This may have contributed to his desire to replace the senior management. Hellyer's choice at one point was a businessman named McIsaac from Winnipeg (Hellyer, 1968a). It appears that the Quebec members of the Liberal network stymied that move. Hellyer appears (from his correspondence) to have attempted to recruit airline executives from the United States but they seem to think that he had a viable candidate at the airline (Seagrim?). Pratte's name did not become public as a possible candidate until October 1967, only a few weeks before the appointment (Staff, 1968b).

Beyond the public network of the discussion mentioned in the previous paragraphs there was a more secretive link to the desire for change. Liberal Party insiders had developed a plan to share government advertising contracts among Quebec-based agencies (Axworthy, 1969a, 1969b). The actors in this network included Clint Drummond, Executive Assistant to the Minister of Finance; Kevin Drummond, Executive Assistant to the President of the Treasury Board; Paul Fortin, Executive Assistant to the Minister of Industry Trade and Commerce; Senator Richard Stanbury; Minister Marc Lalonde; Minister Jean Marchand; Minister Jean Pepin; Al O'Brien, National Director of the Liberal Federation of Canada; John Nichol, President of the Liberal Federation;

and John Payne, Communications Chair of the Liberal Federation. Air Canada had been using a New York advertising firm and refused to place its million-dollar contract with the firm chosen by the group. These members of the Liberal Party (and Government) actor-network may have enrolled an understanding that involved appointing a leadership at Air Canada that would participate in the advertising program. The central corporeal actant enrolled in this network appears to be the "memo describing political distribution of advertising contracts". Minister Hellyer donated a file to the National Archives titled, *Patronage*. This file is filled with memos among the actors that appear to inscribe the idea of employing a specific list of advertising firms (Hellyer, 1968b).

Within the Liberal Party there appears to be an extensive list of actors interested in change at Air Canada. Into that group, the election of Trudeau as leader enrolled new understandings and ideas for the future of the country and party. The concepts of the *Just Society* became powerful actants in the network. These NCAs included bilingualism, affirmative action for French-Canadians and social justice for everyone. It became important to provide a living income for all Canadians. These understandings did not interact well with Air Canada's most powerful NCA of fiscal responsibility.

In a response to the 1968 throne speech commenting on the *Just Society*, Walter Stewart, a journalist and political commentator, wrote, "There is a woman who lives in Winnipeg, in a crumbling slum, in a house that must hide, between its dank walls, at least thirty people within five rooms. She has several children—I couldn't make out how many in the hubbub—one of who (sic) is retarded, a drooling vegetable, the woman is on welfare. Her husband worked; he had quite a good job as a mechanic, but then Air Canada closed its overhaul base in Winnipeg, and he was bumped out of his position by an Air Canada mechanic with better qualifications and then because of the anti-inflation fight, jobs were hard to get…Finally the man said to hell with it, and took off. … So the woman is on welfare…" (Stewart, 1971, p. 17). This sort of criticism of the effectiveness of the promise of social justice provoked a response against the crown corporation, which had seemingly acted so capitalistically.

NCAs develop as a conversation among positions established by the corporeal actors and actants. But they do not exist merely in that discourse but also in context and within each actor. A relational description or depiction as identity does not adequately describe the existence of NCAs. As they live in many places at the same time, possibly under the same name with different meanings. The positions of the various sectors of the Liberal Party enrolled several understandings that criticized the pre-Pratte management of Air Canada complicating the history's inclusion of the hiring of French Canadians as a triumph. In the Cabinet meeting where the appointment of Pratte was approved, the Winnipeg shops, possible labour strife (strikes), organizational growth, and a need for *new blood* were given as the primary rationales for the appointment (Stoner, 1968a). These understandings appear to have reinforced one another and enrolled a primary NCA of change; change away from McGregor and Seagrim.

Move 3: Surface the possible locations of sensemaking activities

The purpose of this move is to situate the activity that prompts sensemaking in physical locations and points is time. Much of the activity in this actor-network seems to take place in memos circulated among senior Liberals (both politicians and party officials). In the surfacing of the possible locations of the sensemaking activities, it is observed that some discussions took place in Cabinet Meetings; it is deduced that Minister without Portfolio Richardson (from Winnipeg) and Minister of Transport Hellyer may have had some ad hoc discussions about the issue. This is likely given that Richardson's office was located within the Transport Minister's offices. In addition some memos in Hellyer's files indicate that meetings with members of the Liberal Party Federation officials on the matter also occurred. Much of the material was transcribed into memos. Several memos have hand written notes on them. These artifacts provide traces of the private discussions. The public discussions around the Air

Canada appointment centre on the struggles between the Government and the airline over a French-Canadian presence at the management table (Bureau, 1968). Several names were considered including Herb Seagrim, then Executive-VP; a Winnipeg businessman named R. H. McIsaac; Deputy Minister John R. Baldwin (who later became President but not CEO); and Lawyer Yves Pratte. News reports indicate that Trudeau directed Transport Minister Hellyer to pick Pratte, a choice Hellyer instructed the Board of Air Canada to make. It could well be that Trudeau's role led to the dominance of the narrative presented in the histories of Government and Party.

The clear indication from the post-appointment issues of *Between Ourselves* and *Horizons* is that Pratte was focused on running the organization. Baldwin made speeches and wrote columns, but Pratte made decisions. Pratte was French-Canadian, and was Trudeau's suggested appointee for the job. In the examination of the *Just Society*, Pratte is a symbol of the redress of the discrimination against French-Canadians. The NCAs spawned by the *Just Society* have influenced the decision, but more centrally to this discussion, they have provided influence over the sensemaking of the choice of narratives in the histories of the party. Over time the importance of each NCA has changed as has the manner in which sensemakers interact the NCAs. Over time the person, Trudeau, appears to have become more important than his ideas.

Histories of the Liberal Party are generally celebratory of Trudeau, his accomplishments and his intellect. The concepts of appointments for patronage reasons or spiteful reasons over the unwillingness of McGregor/Seagrim to *play ball* on the Winnipeg shops would be contrary to this celebration. It appears that the understanding of Trudeau (and his era) as *just*, influences the writing (sensemaking) and limits the possible narratives to those which show the choice of Pratte in the most positive light.

Move 4: Identify sensemaking properties of the events

The previous section surfaced some relationships to the properties of sensemaking. In this section Weick's (1995) seven socio-psychological properties of sensemaking are linked to these relationships. The most central properties relevant for the surfacing of NCAs are the social and retrospective nature of the construction of the narrative. The narrative is a product of one individual but he is situated within the network. The network is a strong constituent of the identity of each human actor. Their enrollment in the network attaches the individual to the understandings of the network and gives power to those NCAs in their sensemaking. Each individual's identity is (in part) an expression of their dyadic relationship with each actor and actant, particularly NCAs. As their own unique understanding of memes and understanding the NCA, strongly influences the choice of narrative.

As each member of the Liberal Party network of the Trudeau era enrolled, they appear to have accepted the ideology of the *Just Society* and the positive image of Canada under the Trudeau Government. In their individual performative identity they would present the need to redress wrongs of the past and to mimic the success of Trudeau. The choice to be involved in a patronage plan around advertising may well have been made sense of in terms of the need to perpetuate the good works of the Party. In the publication, authorship and promotion of histories of the period, the network members would make prospective sense of the image produced.

It would be an anathema to the members of this network to include narratives contrary to the sense of the times (the holistic view). The controlling NCAs: *the Just Society* and; Trudeau *the good* shape the choices of traces to be followed and anti-narratives to be dismissed. The only plausible story is the story that fits with the dominant understandings, i.e., linking the change of AC's CEO to the NCA of *redress of the discrimination against French-Canadians*.

Move 5: Identify enrollments and de-enrollments of human actors (and networks)

The election of the Liberal Party under Lester Pearson in 1963 began a series of de-enrollments and new

appointments to the Board of Air Canada. This changed the relationship between the political party and Air Canada. The selection of Pierre Trudeau as leader of the Party in 1968 began a series of changes to the network of the Liberals who were interested in the management of Air Canada. These enrollments and de-enrollments played a significant role in the Liberal Party and AC through the next twenty plus years, and particularly, in the publication of histories of the period.

The most significant de-enrollment was Minister of Transport, Paul Hellyer. In the years following his defeat by Trudeau for the leadership of the Party, Hellyer left the Party, formed his own Federal Party, folded that Party, joined the Progressive Conservative Party, ran for its leadership, lost that, and left politics. Each of these steps took him further and further away from the inner circle of the Liberal Party. At the time of the decision to appoint Pratte as CEO of Air Canada and Baldwin as its President, Hellyer was central to the network—the directives went through him. It appears that he may have gone along with the Trudeau suggestion to appoint Pratte as a means to consolidate his position. When he could not convert his connections into support for a housing policy he had written, Hellyer left the Party. He was written out of the official narrative of Liberal success. As the narrative of the period was converted into history, Hellyer was on the outside.

Other party insiders, who may have been inclined to continue the messages of C.D. Howe, also left the inner circle of the Liberal Party after the 1968 leadership race. For example, Paul Martin Sr. ran three times for the leadership of the Party. After his last loss (to Trudeau) he accepted appointment to the Canadian Senate and appears to have focused on the career of his son, Paul Martin Jr. who was successful on his second attempt to become Liberal leader and Prime Minister (McCall-Newman, 1982). In the intervening years, the Martins were on the outside of the Trudeau (and later Chretien) incarnations of the Liberal Party.

The histories of the Party and the Trudeau period were initially written during the period where the inner circle consisted of actors who accepted the NCA of the actions of Trudeau as in the best interests of the country. These actors who may have presented anti-narratives were de-enrolled and no narrative criticizing Trudeau was permitted enrollment. The treatment of the "Sky shops" scandal as peripheral to the Party and limited to Marc Lalonde (then Minister of Transport) in the histories demonstrates the *Teflon* nature of the Trudeau myth (Meisel, 2004). Lalonde, who was part of the network proposing the *patronage* advertising contracts, was not de-enrolled from the network even though he resigned as Minister. In the Prime Ministership of Paul Martin Jr., it appears that the anti-Chretien members of the inner circle permitted wider discussion of the failings of the Party, which may have led to the "Sponsorship Scandal" (McCall-Newman, 1982; Stewart, 1971; Trudeau, 1993). The "Sponsorship Scandal" involved several members of the Trudeau/Chretien Liberals (including Lalonde) in a scheme to funnel advertising and promotion contracts through a group of Quebec-based advertising agencies. The nuts and bolts of this scheme appear very similar to the one described in Hellyer's files for 1967-69 (Hellyer, 1968b).

It seems that Martin's network of the Liberal Party permitted anti-narratives of Liberal patronage to reach the media and they are included in more recent histories. But, the Trudeau era is still cloaked in the understandings of the *Just Society* and *Trudeau-mania*. These NCAs have been very persistent in the changing network of the Party surviving nearly complete de-enrollment of human actors.

Move 6: Identify the NCAs enrolled and de-enrolled

The enrollments and de-enrollments described in the previous section do not appear to have made significant changes in the sensemaking of authors when dealing with the Trudeau period of the history of the Liberal Party. The understandings enrolled as NCAs appear to persist and influence the choice of traces followed and chosen; however, we do see a change in message with regard to the Post-Trudeau period which appears to undermine the

ongoing influence of the understanding of whatever is done is for the greater good.

In the descriptions of events in the Chretien era (1993-2003), narratives of graft and misdeeds are permitted (Clarkson, 2005; Cross & Young, 2002; Jeffrey, 2010). This is a departure from the previous period and appears to be the result of the de-enrollment of the person, Pierre Trudeau as an actor and the delegitimizing of the understandings protecting those acts as for the better good. These NCAs appear to be tied to the presence of the actor, Trudeau. The narratives surrounding similar events and producing divergent histories appear to demonstrate the persistence of the NCAs surrounding the Trudeau period.

A contrary ANTi-History (Durepos & Mills, 2012) view of the difference between accounts of similar circumstances from different periods would be the discussion of persistence of accounts. In the ANTi-History works of Durepos, she has shown that accounts persist even in the face of contrary evidence. Later authors tend to rely on the histories of their predecessor authors when recounting a period already researched and described. In this way the inscription, which is a prior history, is enrolled as an actant in the network of future publications.

The persistent NCAs surrounding the Trudeau period, particularly the understandings surrounding his altruistic and heroic nature appear to suppress contrary accounts. Sensemaking of the events of the time appears controlled by the same NCAs regardless of the chronology of the retrospection.

Move 7: Identify the persistent NCAs linked to de-enrolled human actors

The Liberal Party as a network of insiders relating to Air Canada changed substantially over time, but the Liberal Party as a discussant of the appointment of Yves Pratte as CEO of Air Canada has not changed very much. The differences are very much related to retrospective and prospective sensemaking. It appears that the network has foreclosed its view of the Trudeau period. The network of that time is punctualized and an understanding of it has become an NCA in the ongoing network of the Party. Essentially speaking, the understanding of the Trudeau period has become a dominant NCA of the ongoing network of the Liberal Party. It persists and in its persistence the NCA is a powerful influence on the sensemaking of those events. Retrospections change in only a very limited fashion.

Relating this persistence to the individual, we plausibly conceive of the understanding as having extended from the external to the internal. The actor/sensemaker has changed; their identity now includes the idea as they understand it. The NCA has become fused with the human in a form of cyborg (Haraway, 2006). Not a fusion of a corporeal actant as in the cyborg of steel and human flesh, but a cyborg of human and NCAs, in their changed identity (Silverman, 1990).

This new identity controls our sensemaking of past events and future choices and it also influences our networking decisions. We enroll in networks of new friends who share the NCA and de-enroll from networks of old friends who don't. For the author, this identity, which constrains their narrative to those celebrating the Liberals of the late 1960s, provides for them a readership of others who share the understanding and may exclude others who don't. To the advantage of the network of the Liberal Party, some may choose to read the history because they previously enrolled in the network of this author. The understanding may be further promulgated and the NCAs may find themselves enrolled in new networks via the publication.

5. Summary

Understanding the nature of the network and the reasons why actors enroll is central to the following of actors within an actor-network. These reasons are a form of sensemaking but they are also cues to the forces of

influence and power at work in a network. NCAs seem to represent ideas that work together to form the ideology aspirational to the members of the network. As actors identify with the group and become more tightly enrolled in the network, the strength of the network's influence upon them becomes stronger.

But, the actions of individuals are very personal and local. To describe any act as the product of a network ignores the choice made by the person who acted. When we look closely at choices made (as in this paper) we can see the influence of specific understandings of ideas. For example, we do not see discussions of political scandals in histories when they refer to Trudeau. We could attribute this simply to a desire to portray the Liberal Party in the best light, but we do see the scandals referred to when other leaders are mentioned. Somehow this NCA became modified by a competing desire to be frank and honest. Party writings in the 1960s attribute some credit to Hellyer, but in later works he is written out. The actions of individuals in the network seem to have been influenced by the network.

In the analysis of the specific events of 1968 and the appointment of Pratte, the research has surfaced a change in the network fundamental to the *Just Society* movement within the Liberal Party. This *Just Society* does not have a firm description, it is a generalization. It could be compared to an ideology, which is a collection of ideas. In such a collection there is much room for ideas to interact and take many different forms, this is central to the idea of the NCA. History seems to demonstrate that being business-like and profitable remained important to AC, but these ideas took a backseat to the political priorities of the Liberal Party. Even though Hellyer was responsible to Parliament for the financial health of AC, he seemed to believe he was more responsible to the Liberal Party for providing a cooperative crown corporation; one that was willing to use the correct advertising firm, keep jobs where there were Liberal Members of Parliament and promote French-Canadians (with ties to the Party).

References:

Axworthy L. (1969a). "Advertising policy (1)", in: E. A. Mr. Kevin Drummond (Ed.): 2, Ottawa, Canada.

Axworthy L. (1969b). "Advertising policy (2)", in: E. A. Mr. Paul Fortin (Ed.): 2, Ottawa, Canada.

Barthes R. (2000). *The Photographic Message: Theorizing Communication: Readings across Traditions*, pp. 191-199.

Baudrillard J. (1983). *The Precession of Simulacra*, New York.

Baxter C. (1967). "Hellyer's button-button game: Who's new Air Canada head?", *Financial Post*, Toronto, On.

Baxter C. (1968). "Top command at Air Canada still empty", *Financial Post*, Toronto, On.

Bowen G. (2008). "Naturalistic inquiry and the saturation concept: A research note", *Qualitative Research*, Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 137-152.

Bureau O. (1968). *Saulnier Touted for Air Canada: The Star*, Montreal.

Clarkson S. (2005). *The Big Red Machine*, Vancouver, BC: UBC Press.

Collins D. H. (1978). *Wings across Time: The Story of Air Canada*, Toronto: Griffin Press.

Cross W. and Young L. (2002). "Policy attitudes of party members in Canada: Evidence of ideological politics", *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, Vol. 35, No. 4, pp. 859-880.

Durepos G. and Mills A. J. (2011). *ANTi-History: Theorizing the Past, History, and Historiography in Management and Organizational Studies*, Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

Durepos G. and Mills A. J. (2012). *ANTi-History: Theorizing the Past, History, and Historiography in Management and Organizational Studies*, Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.

Dutton J. E., Roberts L. M. and Bednar J. (2010). "Pathways for positive identity construction at work: Four types of positive identity and the building of social resources", *The Academy of Management Review (AMR)*, Vol. 35, No. 2, pp. 265-293.

Executive A. (1967). "Confidential: Air Canada", in: *Transport*, (Ed.): Ottawa: Unknown Author from U.S. Airline.

Gioia D. and Thomas J. (1996). "Identity, image and issue interpretation: Sensemaking during strategic change in academia", *Administrative Science Quarterly*, Vol. 41, No. 3, pp. 370-403.

Grant A. M., Dutton J. E. and Rosso B. D. (2008). "Giving commitment: Employee support programs and the prosocial sensemaking process", *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 51, No. 5, pp. 898-918.

Halbert A. (2012). *Exclusive: The Enigma that Is Barack Hussein Obama*, Part Two, Western Journalism: Western Center for Journalism.

Haraway D. (2006). "A Cyborg Manifesto: Science, technology, and socialist-feminism in the late 20th century", in: J. Weiss, J. Nolan, J. Hunsinger, & P. Trifonas (Eds.), *The International Handbook of Virtual Learning Environments*, Springer Netherlands, pp. 117-158.

Hartt C. (2013a). "Actants without Actors: Polydimensional discussion of a regional conference", *Tamara Journal for Critical Organization Inquiry*, Vol. 11, No. 3, p. 11.

Hartt C. (2013b). "The non-corporeal actant as a link between actor-network theory and critical sensemaking: A case study of Air Canada", Saint Mary's University, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

Hartt C., Mills A. J., Helms Mills J. and Corrigan L. (2013). "Sensemaking and actor-networks: The non-corporeal actant and the making of an Air Canada history", Management History Research Group, Lancaster, UK.

Hellyer P. (1968a). "Memo", in: M. O. Transport (Ed.), Vol. MG-32, B33, V52, Ottawa, On.

Hellyer P. (1968b). "Patronage", in: M. O. Transport (Ed.), Vol. MG-32, B33, V55, Ottawa, On.

Hellyer P. (1990). *Damn the Torpedoes: My Fight to Unify Canada's Armed Force*, McClelland & Stewart Toronto, ON.

Hellyer P. (2003). "Missile defense: It was wrong then and it's wrong now", *Globe and Mail*, Vol. 15.

Helms Mills J. and Mills A. J. (2000a). "Rules, sensemaking, formative contexts and discourse in the gendering of organizational culture", *Handbook of Organizational Culture and Climate*, pp. 55-70.

Helms Mills J. and Mills A. J. (2000b). "Rules, sensemaking, formative contexts, and discourse in the gendering of organizational culture", in: N. Ashkanasy, C. Wilderom, & M. Peterson (Eds.), *Handbook of Organizational Culture and Climate*, Thousand Oaks, London, New Delhi: Sage Publications, Inc., pp. 55-70.

Helms Mills J. and Mills A. J. (2004). "When plausibility fails: Towards a critical sensemaking approach to resistance", in: R. Thomas, A. J. Mills, & J. Helms Mills (Eds.), *Identity Politics at Work: Resisting Gender, Gendering Resistance*, London: Routledge, pp. 141-159.

Helms Mills J., Thurlow A. and Mills A. J. (2010). "Making sense of sensemaking: The critical sensemaking approach", *Qualitative Research in Organizations and Management: An International Journal*, Vol. 5, No. 2, pp. 182-195.

Hinich M. J. and Munger M. C. (1996). *Ideology and the Theory of Political Choice*, Univ of Michigan Pr.

Jeffrey B. (2010). *Divided Loyalties: The Liberal Party of Canada, 1984-2008*, Univ of Toronto Pr.

Krippendorf K. (2008). *On Communicating: Otherness, Meaning, and Information*, Taylor & Francis.

Latour B. (2005a). "On recalling ANT", in: J. Law, & J. Hassard (Eds.), *Actor Network and After*, Oxford: Blackwell and the Sociological Review, pp. 15-25.

Latour B. (2005b). *Reassembling the Social*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

McCall-Newman C. (1982). *Grits: An Intimate Portrait of the Liberal Party*, Toronto: MacMillan of Canada.

McGregor G. R. (1967). "Personal and confidential", in: M. O. T. Paul Hellyer (Ed.), Montreal.

McGregor G. R. (1980). *The Adolescence of an Airline*, Montreal: Air Canada.

Meisel J. (2004). "Echoes of 1957: A realignment in the making?", *Policy*, Vol. 9.

Mills A. J. and Helms Mills J. (2006). "Masculinity and the making of trans-Canada air lines, 1937-1940: A feminist poststructuralist account", *Canadian Journal of Administrative Sciences/Revue Canadienne des Sciences de l'Administration*, Vol. 23, p. 34.

Mills A. J. and Murgatroyd S. J. (1991). *Organizational Rules: A Framework for Understanding Organizational Action*, Milton Keynes [England], Philadelphia: Open University Press.

Mills C. W. (1956). *The Power Elite*, New York: Oxford University Press.

O'Brien A. R. (1969). "Strictly private & confidential", in: M. O. T. Mr. Paul Hellyer (Ed.).

Pigott P. (2001). *National Treasure: The History of Trans Canada Airlines*, Madeira Park, B.C.: Harbour Publishing.

Prasad A. and Mir R. (2002). "Digging deep for meaning: A critical hermeneutic analysis of CEO letters to shareholders in the oil industry", *Journal of Business Communication*, Vol. 39, pp. 92-116.

Preston A. M., Wright C. and Young J. J. (1996). "Imag [in] ing annual reports", *Accounting, Organizations and Society*, Vol. 21, No. 1, pp. 113-137.

Reiss J. (2009). "Causation in the social sciences: Evidence, inference, and purpose", *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*.

Silverman B. G. (1990). "Critiquing human judgment using knowledge-acquisition systems", *AI Magazine*, Vol. 11, No. 3, p. 60.

Silverman S. (2005). *Doing Qualitative Research* (2nd ed.), London: Sage Publications.

Smith F. E. W. (1970). *The First Thirty Years: A History of the Canadian Air Line Pilots Association*, Vancouver: Mitchell Press limited.

Smith P. (1986). *It Seems Like Only Yesterday: Air Canada—The first 50 Years*, Toronto, On: McClelland and Stewart Limited.

Staff (1968a). *The Air Canada Plum, The Star*, Montreal.

Staff (1968b). "Rock asks air Canada guarantee", in a letter to Trudeau, The Gazette, Montreal.

Stevenson G. (1987). *The Politics of Canada's Airlines from Diefenbaker to Mulroney*, Toronto: University of Toronto press.

Stewart W. (1971). *Shrug: Trudeau in Power*, Toronto: New Press.

Stoner O. G. (1968a). "Cabinet conclusions", November 21, 1968, in: P. C. Office (Ed.), Ottawa.

Stoner O. G. (1968b). "Cabinet conclusions", November 25, 1968, in: P. C. Office (Ed.), Ottawa.

Sveningsson S. and Alvesson M. (2003). "Managing managerial identities: Organizational fragmentation, discourse and identity struggle", *Human Relations*, Vol. 56, No. 10, pp. 1163-1193.

Trudeau P. (1993). *Memoirs*, Toronto: McClelland & Stewart.

Weick K. (1995). *Sensemaking in Organizations*, London, UK: Sage Publications Inc.

White H. (1984). "The question of narrative in contemporary historical theory", *History and Theory*, Vol. 23, No. 1, pp. 1-33.

White H. (1988). "Historiography and historiophoty", *The American Historical Review*, Vol. 93, No. 5, pp. 1193-1199.